The Great Replacement

CAUSES AND POTENTIAL RESOLUTION

The mass migration from developing countries to the West is the most contentious and polarising political topic nowadays. Although Western countries encouraged immigration after the Second World War due to labour shortages, today nationalist and populist movements pressure the governments in the United States and Europe to block further immigration. This encourages inflammatory speech by politicians. Besides low-wage immigrants, there is substantial brain drain from developing countries that contributes to problems in their economies. This essay provides a suggestion, perhaps a utopian one, for how developing countries could curtail emigration, for the long term, to achieve economic development comparable to the West in a manner beneficial for both developing countries and the West.

MOSHE ALAMARO

The Great Replacement is usually described as a racist, xenophobic theory; right-wing nationalists in Europe and America claim that elite globalists encourage migration from developing countries to replace the white people in the West.

This assertion and the flood of immigration are the most polarising global political issue nowadays. This claim of replacement has been popularised in recent years, especially in France by Renaud Camus in his book *Le Grand Remplacement*, *(Renaud Camus, Éric Zemmour, Michel Houellebecq, (2016), La fantasmatique du grand remplacement dans le roman français contemporain (Renaud Camus, Éric Zemmour, Michel Houellebecq))* probably since France has a substantial underclass Islamic population that mostly fails to assimilate to the French culture and economy.

This theory is not new. Arnold Toynbee, a British historian who studied the history of two dozen civilisations, concluded that the success of a civilisation is the seed of its decline since it attracts proletarians from everywhere who lay siege to it and dilute its "creative minority". *(Arnold Toynbee, A Study of History,1946)* Ironically, white supremacists, who are concerned about immigration from developing countries, invoke Toynbee in relation to the fall of Rome and Greece. Their downfalls were due to the German barbarians, who brought the destruction of the classical civilisations.

The history of the Great Replacement theory has its roots in the beginning of the twentieth century. Houston Steward Chamberlain, a British Germanophile philosopher, wrote a bestseller, *The Foundations of the Nineteenth Century*, which became an inspiration for the Nazis. *(Houston Chamberlain, (1912). Foundations of the Nineteenth Century)* Madison Grant, American eugenicist, advocated scientific racism and provided statistics for the Immigration Act of 1924 to prevent immigration from Asia and set the quotas on immigrants from Eastern and Southern Europe. *(Madison Grant The Passing of the Great Race, Geographical Review, Vol. 2, No. 5, Nov., 1916)* The Great Replacement theory has instigated killings and terrorism against minorities in Belgium, France, Germany, New Zealand, and the United States, often in response to terrorism committed by Muslim immigrants Some of the mass killing shooters have written manifestos quoting the Great Replacement theory. *(Collins Ben, NBC News, The Buffalo supermarket shooting suspect allegedly posted an apparent manifesto repeatedly citing 'great replacement' theory, 14 May 2022)*

Arnold Toynbee, a British historian who studied the history of two dozen civilisations, concluded that the success of a civilisation is the seed of its decline since it attracts proletarians from everywhere who lay siege to it and dilute its "creative minority".

Some versions of this theory are in circulation now. In December 2023, Donald Trump declared that immigrants "poison our blood". *(Gibson G, NBC News, Dec. 17, 2023, Trump says immigrants are 'poisoning the blood of our country.' Biden campaign likens comments to Hitler)* Pundits on Fox News, such as Tucker Carlson and Laura Ingram, claim that the Democrats want to change the demographic composition of the United States, since immigrants are more likely to vote Democrat. A few Republicans such as J D Vance and Matt Gaetz also endorse this theory.

Does immigration benefit the West? What impact does emigration have on developing countries? This essay explains the causes of emigration from developing countries and offers potential long-term remedies that could benefit both the West and developing nations.

Following the Second World War, due to labour shortages, Germany encouraged Turkish and Italian immigration, just as the United Kingdom in the 1950s encouraged migration from the Empire's former colonies and even provided motorcycles to Caribbean immigrants as an incentive. *(Grannum, G, 2012), Tracing Your Caribbean Ancestors: A National Archives Guide)* But twenty years later, the politician Enoch Powell gave the infamous 'Rivers of Blood' speech. In it, Powell criticised the rates of immigration into the UK and opposed the anti-discrimination Race Relations Bill.

There is no question that immigrants in the United States fill jobs that most Americans decline to take. Most of the back-breaking harvesting jobs in California and elsewhere are filled by immigrants from Central and South America.

A glaring example appeared in the collapse of the Francis Scott Key Bridge in Baltimore's port on 26 March 2024, blocking the port, where six construction workers perished. The incident happened at 1:28am, a time when most Americans decline night-shift jobs. The workers were immigrants from South America.

As for the claims that immigrants are criminals, the Federal Bureau of Investigation's (FBI) statistics show that immigrants are less likely to be criminal relative to their population size, though there is also evidence that many criminal gangs from other countries are active in the USA. *(Garsd J, Immigrants are less likely to commit crimes than U.S.-born Americans, studies find. NPR, 8 March 2024)*

This emigration has devastating impacts on developing countries since it drains them of the most vital, daring, and entrepreneurial segments of their societies. The immigrants from South America travel on foot through the jungles of Venezuela and Colombia, crossing swamps and swimming with children on their back across the Rio Grande. Immigrants to Europe cross the Mediterranean in makeshift boats that often capsize and that, besides the peril to themselves, cause a moral dilemma for Europe.

The scientific work of this author aims to convert semiarid land into arable land. *(Alamaro M, 2022), ReSlope Global)* Between 2021 and 2024, he contacted thousands of scientists and agronomists in Europe, the United States, and elsewhere to disseminate his work. About half of the scientists in Europe and the United States in related fields turned out to be from developing countries. It seems that the West drains from developing countries not only low-wage workers, but also their intelligentsia, which contributes to their failing economies. *(Docquier F, Brain Drain in Developing Countries, The World Bank Economic Review, Volume 21, Issue 2, 2007)*

In 2020, the West spent US$ 161.2 billion on developing countries, which amounts to trillions over the last two decades, serving as an aid bandage that failed to lead to real development. *(Natalie Marchant, Foreign aid hit a record high last year. Here's what it means for the global recovery from COVID, World Economic Forum, Apr 23, 2021)*

An instance of the problem is that the total debt in 2024 of developing countries is US$ 29 trillion, and now dozens of nations are spending more on interest payments than on healthcare or education. *(NY Times, US$ 29 Trillion that's how much debt emerging nations are facing , NY Times, 14 June 2024)*

To stem the emigration from developing countries, it is clear that they should, with the West's assistance, reach industrial development comparable to that of the West. If a new global and long-term policy is developed, it will cost no more than the current foreign aid to these countries nowadays.

There are several fundamental impediments to such development. One is described by Hernando de Soto, President of the Institute for Liberty, and Democracy (Lima), in his seminal book, *The Mystery of Capital*.

According to De Soto, in the West capital works in two ways. One is for the operating costs to run the economy, and the second is as collateral, enabling borrowers to use their capital property for loans for further development. In developing countries instead, most of the capital assets, land, houses, and other property are 'dead' capital: they lack formal deeds and titles to enable selling and transferring their property or to assure lenders of the borrowers' ownership of it. Ownership of capital real estate is transferred informally between generations of squatters, in countries that do not have adequate legal institutions to provide titles, deeds, and inheritance.

Emigration has devastating impacts on developing countries since it drains them of the most vital, daring, and entrepreneurial segments of their societies.

De Soto has been implementing programmes in some countries to enable people to gain such titles, but the culture in traditional societies can block success. In Peru, the value of some properties has increased ninefold using De Soto's programme, but in Egypt, for example, which is plagued by a bloated public sector and stifling bureaucracy, the results have been disappointing. *(Hernando de Soto, Egypt's Economic Apartheid. More than 90% of Egyptians hold their property without legal title. No wonder they can't build wealth and have lost hope. Hernando de Soto, Wall Street Journal, 3 February, 2011)*

One problem is the reluctance of academia to accept De Soto's ideas, since he does not provide a rigorous mathematical analysis. Do his ideas require such analysis? As the economic Nobelist Paul Krugman says, a real economy does not operate by elegant equations. *(Krugman P, How Did Economists Get it so Wrong? New York Times, June 9, 2009)*

The book, *Why Nations Fail, The Origin of Power, Prosperity and Poverty*, by the Nobelists, Acemoglu and Robinson, gives an example of how institutions are important for a functional economy. *(Acemoglu D, Why Nations Fail, The Origin of Power, Prosperity and Poverty. Crown Publishing, New York, 2012)* They compare Nogales, Arizona, to Sonora, over the border from Nogales. Sonora is a relatively prosperous part of Mexico, the income of which is about one-third that in Nogales, Arizona. In both towns, there is no difference in geography, climate, culture, or ethnicity, refuting the assumption that culture is the dominant factor for economic prosperity.

In Nogales, the inhabitants have access to the civil, legal, and economic institutions of the United States, which enable them to choose their occupations freely, acquire schooling and skills, and encourage their employers to invest in the best technology, which leads to higher wages for them. They have laws, especially contract laws, that enable long-term investment in industries, where the investor is assured that the contract will be executed five to ten years later.

In developing countries, such laws are weak or absent, so investors are reluctant to provide funding for long-term industrial development. Therefore, the economy in developing countries is mostly based on lower-value agriculture that provides yield and return on investment over a growing season of a few months.

Another impeding factor is political instability and violence, as seen today in Haiti. The US provides funding for 2,500 police officers from Kenya, itself plagued by political instability and violence. *(New York Times, Haiti's Gang Grow Stronger as Kenya-Led Force Prepares to Deploy, New Yok Times, 14 May 2024)* One reason could be to avoid the colonial legacy since the history of Haiti is full of colonial interventions. To avoid accusations of American occupation that could become a contentious election topic, the US chose this path. It remains to be seen if this approach will bring calm to Haiti.

A serious issue is corruption that plagues developing countries. The Panama Papers provided a list of numerous politicians who parked their ill-gotten fortune in offshore entities, including politicians in Algeria, Angola, Republic of Congo, Gabon, Ghana, Ivory Coast, Rwanda, Kenya, and more. *(Wade, C, The Cost of Corruption in Panama, Garfield Center for Public Leadership, 15 April 2014)* Egypt is a special but not unique case where the former president Mubarak's family is alleged to have amassed US$ 70 billion.

Egypt is poor mostly because it has been ruled by a narrow elite who have organised society for their own benefit at the expense of the vast mass of people. This elite has concentrated political power and used it to create great wealth for those who possess it.

Bribery to politicians in developing countries by foreign international companies compels them to choose projects which are designed to enrich them rather than choose those that could maximise economic development. *(Tawiah V, Corruption, Chinese Investment, and Trade: Evidence from Africa, Journal of Emerging Market Finance, February 8, 2022)* Corruption costs developing countries US$ 1.26 trillion every year, according to the World Economic Forum.

Corruption and favoritism in developing countries has a demoralising effect on the population. For example, when Italy joined the European Union (EU) in 1958, the Italian people were happy since they felt helpless and expected that the EU's regulations would lessen corruption.

Another impediment in traditional societies is 'amoral familism', where people cannot relate to and would not do business with anybody except their immediate or extended family; neither do they feel obligated to fulfill their civic duties. *(Ferragina E, The never-ending debate about The moral basis of a backward society: Banfield and 'amoral familism', 2009, 1 (2), pp141-160, Journal of Anthropological Society)* In contrast, in the West, an impersonal market has evolved where people are willing and able to do business with anybody, a trust attributed to the Protestant culture. *(Henrich J, The WEIRDest People in the World: How the West Became Psychologically Peculiar and Particularly Prosperous, International Sociology, November 26, 2021, Volume 36, Issue 5)* Familism promotes a culture of secrecy, a factor that sometimes contributes to economic failure or at least to growing inequality in society.

Another impediment in traditional societies is 'amoral familism', where people cannot relate to and would not do business with anybody except their immediate or extended family; neither do they feel obligated to fulfill their civic duties.

Here is a list of steps that both developed and developing countries could implement to reduce emigration to the West. The current foreign aid provided for developing nations is not sufficient to address all these issues in all of them, but the West can provide funding for 'showcases' in a few countries, serving as examples that would be imitated broadly.

1. Invest in girls' education: According to Larry Summers, former Chief

Economist of the World Bank, investment in girls' education could provide the best long-term return. *(Malloy, M, Sustainability, gender equality and girls' education: Reflections from approaches to MEL (Monitoring, Evaluation and Learning) in Girls' Education Challenge projects in Kenya , UCL Discovery, May 2024)* In the West, women are increasingly reaching parity with men, but the traditional male-dominated culture in many developing countries is still an obstacle.

2. Foster institutions that will enable legal reforms, especially in regard to contract laws.
3. Fund and broaden the scope of De Soto's Institute for Liberty and Democracy as related to land reforms and to enable squatters to receive titles and deeds for their properties. South Korea's land reforms between the 1950s and1970s show how such reforms led to astounding success: South Korea has reached a level of economic development comparable to Western nations.
4. Block students who receive scholarships from the West from becoming citizens. Students from developing countries where the West provides scholarships should be obliged to return to their countries. However, a student can graduate in one country and be employed in another. Therefore, a global registry of foreign students could be established that includes information on all foreign students so employers could hire these engineers and scientists only after the registry approves it.
5. Develop and foster a 'creative minority' as a professional elite. The West should provide scholarships to political science and humanities students as well as to engineers and scientists. *(De Beukelaer C, Creative industries in "developing" countries: Questioning country classifications in the UNCTAD creative economy reports, 28 May 2014, Cultural Trends, Volume 23, May, 28, 2014)*
6. Install whistleblower laws similar to those of the US that protect and reward those who report corruption and waste, so they receive a cut of the recovered funds. Legal authorities are swamped by such crimes, so such incentives could deter and reduce corruption. *(Rajeev K Goel, R.K, 2014), Whistleblower laws and exposed corruption in the United States, Applied Economics, Volume 46, 2014 - Issue 20)*
7. Free market reform revolutionised the economies of a few poor countries. South Korea, in contrast to North Korea, is a telling example. Israel, which used to be a semi-socialist country, gained economic power starting in the 1990s, when its economy was liberalised. The case of East Germany under the yoke of the USSR, in contrast to West Germany, is also a conspicuous example.

One cornerstone of free market economies is competition among many players in a given industry. An individual player who enters an industrial sector cannot increase supply substantially since many suppliers are already in the market. This is the impetus for the antitrust laws in the West (except for the perhaps inevitable monopoly of the large tech industries).

In small developing countries, the number of players in a given industry is small, and entry of a new supplier can substantially affect and disturb the market. Therefore, in some cases the existing players try to block a new player by any means, legal or not, and even resort to violence. The remedy to this is to develop common markets; many countries in Europe and other continents have such associations that could be imitated in Africa as well.

8. Extend the air conditioning revolution to more southern regions. Air conditioning has increased productivity and quality of life and revolutionised southern regions in the US, Australia, and the affluent countries in the Middle East.

Developing countries could also benefit from the burgeoning carbon credit market to address climate change. Most developing countries have underdeveloped energy systems. If they add additional capacity based on renewable and alternative energy sources, they might collect revenues from energy companies in the West to offset their carbon liability through trading.

(DI2922025TGRCPRMA@2835)